

Parish: Carthorpe
Ward: Tanfield
12

Committee Date: 6 February 2020
Officer dealing: Mrs H Laws
Target Date: 14 February 2020

19/02706/OUT

Outline application for the construction of 3 dwellings (all matters reserved)

At: Land to the south of Hall Garth Farm, Carthorpe

For: Mr & Mrs Trehwitt

This application is referred to Planning Committee as, if approved, it would be a departure from the Development Plan

1.0 SITE, CONTEXT AND PROPOSAL

- 1.1 The site lies towards in the south eastern corner of the village on the eastern side of the road leading to Kirklington. The site covers an area of just over 0.3 hectares and forms part of a larger field. It bounds the road along its western side for a distance of approximately 75m. The boundary is formed by several mature trees and a timber post and rail fence with some scrub hedging. A post and rail fence lies along the northern boundary, shared with the end of a neighbouring garden.
- 1.2 It is proposed to construct three dwellings on the plot. The application is an outline application with all matters reserved. If approved, the matters including access, appearance, landscaping, layout and scale would be for a later application.
- 1.3 A block plan has been provided but this is indicative only as all matters are reserved for future consideration. The drawing illustrates a single access point with a shared driveway for three detached dwellings.

2.0 PLANNING & ENFORCEMENT HISTORY

- 2.1 None

3.0 RELEVANT PLANNING POLICIES:

- 3.1 The relevant policy of the Development Plan and any supplementary planning policy advice are as follows;

Core Strategy Policy CP1 - Sustainable development

Core Strategy Policy CP2 - Access

Core Strategy Policy CP4 - Settlement hierarchy

Core Strategy Policy CP16 - Protecting and enhancing natural and man-made assets

Core Strategy Policy CP17 - Promoting high quality design

Core Strategy Policy CP21 - Safe response to natural and other forces

Development Policies DP1 - Protecting amenity

Development Policies DP4 - Access for all

Development Policies DP30 - Protecting the character and appearance of the countryside

Development Policies DP32 - General design

Development Policies DP43 - Flooding and floodplains

National Planning Policy Framework

Interim Guidance Note - adopted by Council on 7th April 2015

4.0 CONSULTATIONS

4.1 Parish Council – make the following comments:

- The proposed site is isolated from other development on that side of the road and would therefore appear to be outside current Development Limits. Consideration should be given to the impact of the proposed development on the current open character of the surrounding countryside. This proposal may set a precedent for further development along the road into the village.
- The proposed housing mix is limited to 3 & 4 bedroom properties of which Carthorpe has had several built recently and more are in development. Suggested the proposed houses do not meet any current housing needs within the village.
- The dwellings do not reflect the surrounding buildings i.e. Manor House, and may affect the appearance of the village.
- The proposed family properties are sited on or beyond the 30 mph village limit, with no footpath to walk safely upon into the village or to the school bus stops. There is only one street light.
- Consideration must be given to the capacity of existing utilities - water and sewage and to the management of surface water.

4.2 NYCC Highways - In order to secure the visibility splay demonstrated by the applicants' agent, vegetation across the site frontage will require clearing, whilst it is difficult to assess at this stage this may include a large tree near to the 30mph terminal sign. Conditions are recommended.

There is not sufficient space to provide a footway at this location providing a continuous link to the village centre without substantially narrowing the highway. This would not be appropriate given the highway is narrow already. Properties opposite this site and beyond do not benefit from a footway link to the village centre and would not consider a new footway link proportionate with the scale of the development proposed.

4.3 HDC Environmental Health Officer (contaminated land) - From a land contamination perspective I should expect the applicant to submit information that demonstrates the land is suitable for use, in line with the NPPF. Given the former agricultural land use and the associated potential sources of contamination as well as the proposed vulnerable end use (residential), the applicant is required to submit a Phase 1 Preliminary Risk Assessment. A condition is recommended.

5.0 ANALYSIS

5.1 The main issues for consideration in this case relate to (i) the principle of additional dwellings in this location outside Development Limits; (ii) an assessment of the likely impact of the proposed dwellings on the character and appearance of the village and the rural landscape; (iii) housing mix; (iv) neighbour amenity; and (v) highway safety.

The principle of development

5.2 The site falls outside of Development Limits as Carthorpe does not feature within the settlement hierarchy defined within Policy CP4 of the Core Strategy. Policy DP9 states that permission will only be granted for development in such locations in exceptional circumstances. The applicant does not claim any of the exceptional circumstances identified in Policy CP4 and, as such, the proposal would be a departure from the Development Plan. However, it is also necessary to consider more recent national policy in the form of the NPPF. Paragraph 78 of the NPPF states:

"To promote sustainable development in rural areas, housing should be located where it will enhance or maintain the vitality of rural communities. Planning policies should identify opportunities for villages to grow and thrive, especially where this will support local services. Where there are groups of smaller settlements, development in one village may support services in a village nearby".

- 5.3 To ensure appropriate consistent interpretation of the NPPF alongside Policies CP4 and DP9, the Council has adopted Interim Policy Guidance (IPG) relating to Settlement Hierarchy and Housing Development in the Rural Areas. This guidance is intended to bridge the gap between CP4/DP9 and the NPPF and relates to residential development within villages. The IPG has brought in some changes and details how Hambleton District Council will now consider development in and around smaller settlements and has included an updated Settlement Hierarchy.
- 5.4 The IPG states that the Council will support small-scale housing development in villages where it contributes towards achieving sustainable development by maintaining or enhancing the vitality of the local community and where it meets all of the following criteria:
1. Development should be located where it will support local services including services in a village nearby.
 2. Development must be small in scale, reflecting the existing built form and character of the village.
 3. Development must not have a detrimental impact on the natural, built and historic environment.
 4. Development should have no detrimental impact on the open character and appearance of the surrounding countryside or lead to the coalescence of settlements.
 5. Development must be capable of being accommodated within the capacity of existing or planned infrastructure.
 6. Development must conform with all other relevant LDF policies.
- 5.5 In the settlement hierarchy contained within the IPG, Carthorpe is defined as an 'Other Settlement'; within the IPG small scale development adjacent to the main built form of the settlement "will be supported where it results in incremental and organic growth". To satisfy criterion 1 of the IPG the proposed development must provide support to local services including services in a village nearby. The site lies adjacent to the village of Carthorpe which is identified in the IPG as an example of a cluster village together with Burneston. The two villages have long been linked economically and socially. Collectively they have churches, a primary school, two pubs and a shop. Connectivity is good between the two villages which are readily accessible on foot or bicycle as well as by car. Carthorpe is less than a kilometre distance from Burneston and the application site is a further 0.25km through the village. Criterion 1 would be satisfied.

Character and appearance of the village and the rural landscape

- 5.6 It is important to consider the likely impact of the proposed development with particular regard to criteria 2, 3 and 4 of the IPG. Proposals must be small in scale and provide a natural infill or extension to an existing settlement and also conform to other relevant Local Development Framework Policies.
- 5.7 These criteria require development to be small scale; to respect the built form and character of the village; and to have no detrimental impact on the open character and appearance of the surrounding countryside.

- 5.8 Although there is domestic development on the eastern side of this village road it comprises principally of domestic gardens and therefore there is only a small amount of built development for a considerable distance (approximately 85m) before the application site. There are two bungalows to the west, each set within substantial gardens and set back from the road. The application site and its surroundings therefore are more open in character, principally due to the agricultural nature of the application site. The construction of a row of dwellings on this land, with or without a shared access and driveway, would significantly alter its character. The aim of the IPG is to enable the village to evolve in a way that represents the traditional pattern of growth resulting in buildings that are appropriate to their setting. The development of the application site would be of detriment to the form and character of the village, contrary to LDF Policies CP17 and DP32, which require new development to respect local character and distinctiveness.
- 5.9 It is considered that the development of this site would not respect the existing built form and character of the village and would be contrary to CP17, DP32 and criteria 2 of the IPG.
- 5.10 The site does not have the appearance of being a part of the village; it has more in keeping with the adjacent countryside as part of the rural landscape. The development as proposed would therefore extend domestic characteristics into the rural landscape. It is considered that the proposed residential development of this site would have a detrimental impact on the openness of the surrounding rural landscape and would therefore be contrary to LDF Policies DP16 and DP30.

Housing mix

- 5.11 The development, although an outline application, details on the application form the intention to construct 1no. 3 bedroomed dwelling and 2no. 4 bedroomed dwellings. Many of the dwellings recently approved within the village, mostly at the western end of Carthorpe, have been three and four bedroomed properties and the Parish Council has expressed concern that this would not meet any current housing needs. The Council has never instigated a Housing Needs Survey in Carthorpe but the Strategic Housing Market Assessment (2016) has identified the need for two and three bedroomed dwellings generally within the District. It is also apparent that there is a lack of bungalows in Carthorpe. It is considered that this mix would not meet the identified housing need in this locality.

Impact on the amenity of neighbouring occupiers

- 5.12 LDF Policy DP1 requires that all development proposals must adequately protect amenity, particularly with regard to privacy, security, noise and disturbance, pollution (including light pollution), vibration and daylight.
- 5.13 The position and size of the site is such that it would allow for a design to achieve satisfactory levels of separation and avoid overlooking and overshadowing of existing and proposed dwellings. The effect of the additional households served by a new access onto the Kirklington road is unlikely to have a significant impact on the amenity of the nearby residents.
- 5.14 It is considered that the development would not adversely affect the amenity of existing and proposed residents and would be in accordance with Policy DP1.

Highway safety

- 5.15 The Highway Authority has indicated that the provision of the access in the position illustrated on the indicative site plan would require the removal of some of the vegetation along the front boundary of the site.
- 5.16 The provision of a footway, although beneficial for providing a safe pedestrian access to the centre of the village to connect to existing footways, could not be provided along the roadside due to the width of the existing carriageway. Due to the number of dwellings proposed the Highway Authority would not require its provision.
- 5.17 There are no objections to the proposed development from the Highway Authority and as such it is considered that the proposed development will have no detrimental impact on road safety.

Planning Balance

- 5.18 The proposed development is outside any defined Development Limits and the applicant does not claim any exceptions under Policy CP4. Albeit that there would be some social and economic advantages through the provision of three new houses, the economic gain from the residential development and future occupation would be limited. The harm to the form and character of the village and the countryside is substantial and this harm to the environment is not outweighed by the limited social and economic gains. There are no other material considerations that would outweigh the adopted LDF policies and refusal of the application is recommended.

6.0 RECOMMENDATION:

- 6.1 That subject to any outstanding consultations the application be **REFUSED** for the following reasons:

The reasons are:-

1. The scheme is contrary to CP4 of the Hambleton Local Development Framework and does not meet any of the exceptional circumstances for development outside Development Limits. It also fails to comply with the requirements of the Council's Interim Policy Guidance Note as the location does not respect the built form of Carthorpe by proposing development where it is considered not to be organic growth of the village, providing a natural infill to existing development or a natural extension to the built form.
2. The proposed development is contrary to Policies CP16 and DP30 of the Hambleton Local Development Framework, which requires development to preserve and enhance the District's natural assets and to respect the openness of the countryside. Due to the domestic character of the residential development, it would fail to respect the character and appearance of this rural countryside setting and the built form of Carthorpe and would therefore have a detrimental effect on the immediate environment.